Abstract

Aim: The present investigation was undertaken to evaluate the toxicity of seven novel chemical and biological insecticides [flubendiamide 39.35 SC, chlorantraniliprole 18.5 SC, emamectin benzoate 5 SG, novaluron 10 EC, indoxacarb 15.8 EC and two Bacillus thuringiensis var. kurstaki (Btk formulations)] and five conventional chemical insecticides (dimethoate 30 EC, malathion 50 EC, monocrotophos 36 SL, profenofos 50 EC and lambda-cyhalothrin 5 EC) against the parasitoids of castor semilooper.

Methodology: The toxic effect of insecticides was evaluated by treating the parasitized eggs using an atomizer in the case of egg parasitoid, Trichogramma chilonis, while topical bioassay and dry film residue method was used against pupal and adult stages of larval parasitoid, Snellenius maculipennis, respectively. The effect was categorized as per International Organisation for Biological Control Safety Classification.

Results: The toxicity of insecticides was evaluated by treating the parasitized eggs using an atomizer in the case of egg parasitoid, Trichogramma chilonis, while topical bioassay and dry film residue method was used against pupal and adult stages of larval parasitoid, Snellenius maculipennis, respectively. The effect was categorized as per International Organisation for Biological Control Safety Classification.

Interpretation: Btk formulations, flubendiamide, chlorantraniliprole and novaluron were found harmless to both egg parasitoid, T. chilonis and larval parasitoid, S. maculipennis. These safer insecticides can be incorporated in IPM module to unify the safe and sustainable use of chemical and bio-control methods.
Introduction

Among biological constraints in the castor production, undoubtedly insect pests dominate the scenario. In India more than 100 species of insects are recorded on castor at different phenological stages of the crop. However, about half a dozen of them are of economic importance in India. Among them semilooper, Achaea janata L. (Lepidoptera: Noctuidae) is the most important pest in the rainfed castor belts of Southern India and is also known to occur regularly throughout the country wherever the crop is grown (Duraimurugan et al., 2017).

The older larvae are voracious feeders which often totally defoliate the crop at the peak level of infestation. It is estimated that yields are reduced by 30-50% due to castor semilooper alone (Rao et al., 2012). Farmers frequently utilize insecticides to overcome the damage inflicted by insect pests. However, unwise use of broad spectrum insecticides is unsafe to natural enemies. Castor semilooper is attacked by an array of parasitoids, among them Trichogramma chilonis Ishii (Hymenoptera: Trichogrammatidae) and Snellenius (Microplitis) maculipennis (Szépligeti) (Hymenoptera : Braconidae) are the most potential parasitoids in the castor ecosystem. T. chilonis is the most powerful egg parasitoid attacking semilooper eggs and the rate of parasitism is reported to be up to 92%, while S. maculipennis is a solitary larval endoparasitoid of semilooper which parasitizes up to 96% of larvae in the field under favourable conditions (Basappa, 2003; Prabhakar and Prasad, 2005). One of the key approaches in Integrated Pest Management (IPM) programme is appropriate selection of an insecticide which will reduce the pest with minimum disruptive effect on its natural enemies (Patra et al., 2017).

Therefore, more understanding of pest-natural enemy-insecticide interaction is needed to formulate more effective IPM strategies (Preetha et al., 2010; Pearsons and Tooker, 2017). In the present study, laboratory bioassays were carried out to determine the effect of a set of novel and conventional insecticides against T. chilonis and S. maculipennis with an objective to search for comparatively less toxic insecticide against the parasitoids to be incorporated into IPM programme.

Materials and Methods

Parasitoids: The egg parasitoid, T. chilonis was obtained from National Institute of Plant Health Management (NIPHM), Hyderabad and used for the study. Laboratory culture of S. maculipennis was established from the field parasitized larvae of castor semilooper from Research Farm, ICAR-Indian Institute of Oilseeds Research, Hyderabad during Kharif 2014. The parasitized larvae were collected and individually placed in a plastic container (9 cm x 4 cm) having a small circular hole on the lid covered with fine brass mess. The parasitized larvae were maintained in a container at room temperature and observed for emergence of pupa (cocoon) at the posterior end of the parasitized larvae (Fig. 1A and B). The pupa was held until adult parasitoids emerged. A cotton swab soaked in 50% honey solution was kept in the container for S. maculipennis adults. The pupae (Fig. 1C) and adult (Fig. 1D) parasitoids (1-day-old) were used for the experiments.

Insecticides: Commercial formulations of five newer chemical insecticides (flubendiamide 39.35 SC, chlorantraniliprole 18.5 SC, emamectin benzoate 5 SG, indoxacarb 15.8 EC and novaluron 10 EC), two formulations of bioinsecticide, Bacillus thuringiensis var. kurstaki (Delfin and DOR Bi-1) and five conventional insecticides (profenofos 50 EC, monocrotophos 36 SL, malathion 50 EC, dimethoate 30 EC and lambda-cyhalothrin 5 EC) were used in the experiment.

Bioassay techniques: Bioassay method described by Jalali and Singh (1993) was used to evaluate the toxic effect of insecticides to T. chilonis eggs under laboratory conditions. The bioassay was conducted in completely randomized design with twelve insecticide treatments along with an untreated control and replicated twice. The parasitized egg cards of 3-day old were cut into one cm² bits and sprayed with insecticides at field recommended concentrations using an atomizer. In each treatment, about 0.5 ml of spray fluid was used for each card. For untreated check, only distilled water was sprayed. The treated egg cards were shade dried at room temperature. After drying, each card was put in a test tube (10 x 2.5 cm) and kept at ambient conditions (27±2ºC, 60-70% RH) and observed for emergence of the adults. Thirty pupae for each treatment (three replicates each of 10 pupae) were used in completely randomized design. The mortality of the pupae was assessed on the basis of the failure of adult emergence.

No. of wasps emerged/Total no. of eggs in 1 cm² x 100.

Topical bioassay method described by Mgocheki and Addison (2009) was used to assess the effect of insecticides to pupae (cocoons) of S. maculipennis under laboratory conditions. Ten one-day old pupae were selected and placed on castor leaf which was placed on plastic container (9 cm x 4 cm) as described earlier. The recommended field concentration of respective insecticide was sprayed on the pupae using an atomizer and allowed to dry for an hour. The container kept at ambient conditions (27±2ºC, 60-70% RH) and observed for emergence of the adults. Thirty pupae for each treatment (three replicates each of 10 pupae) were used in completely randomized design. The mortality of the pupae was assessed on the basis of the failure of adult emergence.

Dry film residue method described by Desneux et al. (2006) was used to evaluate the toxic effect of insecticides to adults of S. maculipennis under laboratory conditions. Recommended concentration of insecticides was prepared using water. Glass vials of 40 ml capacity were uniformly coated with 0.5 ml of insecticide solution and dried by manual rolling of the vial horizontally on a table. Adults of S. maculipennis were released into the vials @ 10 per vial and covered with muslin cloth. After one-hour of exposure, they were released in test tubes (10 x 2.5
cm) and 50% honey solution was given as feed and observations on the adult mortality were recorded at 24 and 48 hrs after treatment (HAT). For untreated check, water alone was used. Mortality per cent of adults was worked out by the following formula:

\[
\text{Mortality (\%)} = \frac{\text{No. of adults dead}}{\text{Total number of adults}} \times 100.
\]

The insecticidal effect on life stages of \textit{T. chilonis} and \textit{S. maculipennis} was classified as per International Organisation for Biological Control, West Palaearctic Regional Section (IOBC/WPRS) Working Group (Nasreen et al., 2000) as harmless (<30% mortality), slightly harmful (30–79% mortality), moderately harmful (80–99% mortality) and harmful (>99% mortality).

**Statistical analysis**: The per cent mortality values were converted to arcsine percentage and subjected to analysis of variance (ANOVA) followed by means separation using least significant difference (LSD) test at 5% level of significance.

## Results and Discussion

The adult emergence of \textit{T. chilonis} ranged from 31.9 to 90.1% among the insecticidal treatments. \textit{Bacillus thuringiensis} var. \textit{kurstaki} (Btk) formulations viz., Delfin and DOR Bt-1 recorded 90.1 and 88.5% adult emergence and found at par with each other, while 98.2% adult emergence was recorded in untreated control. The novel insecticides viz., flubendiamide, chlorantraniliprole, novaluron and emamectin benzoate recorded 67.6 to 78.8% adult emergence. The conventional insecticides viz., malathion, dimethoate, lambdacyhalothrin, profenofos and monocrotophos resulted 31.9 to 60.7% adult emergence (Table 1). Based on the criteria suggested by IOBC to assess the toxicity of insecticides to natural enemies, Btk formulations, flubendiamide, chlorantraniliprole, indoxacarb and novaluron had lesser effect on \textit{T. chilonis} and were categorized as harmless (<30% mortality), while emamectin benzoate, dimethoate, profenofos, malathion, monocrotophos and lambdacyhalothrin were rated as slightly harmful (30–79% mortality).

The results revealed that there were significant differences between the insecticidal treatments with respect to percentage pupal mortality of \textit{S. maculipennis}. The per cent mortality of pupa ranged between 0.0 to 53.3% among the insecticidal treatments. Among them, both the formulations of Btk (Delfin and DOR Bt-1) and untreated control caused no mortality. Novaluron, flubendiamide and chlorantraniliprole recorded pupal mortality of 6.7 to 13.3% and were found at par with each other. It was followed by emamectin benzoate, indoxacarb, and dimethoate recorded 16.7 to 20.0% pupal mortality. Profenofos, monocrotophos and malathion recorded pupal mortality of 26.7, 33.3 and 36.7%, respectively. Lambdacyhalothrin recorded highest mortality of 53.3% (Table 1). Based on the criteria suggested by IOBC to evaluate the toxicity of insecticides to natural enemies, Btk formulations, novaluron, flubendiamide, chlorantraniliprole, emamectin benzoate, indoxacarb, dimethoate and profenofos were rated as harmless (<30% mortality).

### Table 1: Effect of novel and conventional insecticides to egg parasitoid, \textit{Trichogramma chilonis} and larval parasitoid, \textit{Snellenius maculipennis}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Treatments</th>
<th>Concentration</th>
<th>Chemical class</th>
<th>\textit{T. chilonis}</th>
<th>\textit{S. maculipennis}</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Adult emergence (%)</td>
<td>Pupal mortality (%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{1}) - Flubendiamide 39.35SC</td>
<td>0.2 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Phthalic acid diamide</td>
<td>78.8 (62.6)(^{ab})</td>
<td>6.7 (12.4)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{2}) - Chlorantraniliprole 18.5SC</td>
<td>0.3 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Anthranilic diamide</td>
<td>73.5 (59.0)(^{ab})</td>
<td>13.3 (21.2)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{3}) - Emamectin benzoate 5SG</td>
<td>0.5 g l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Avermectin</td>
<td>67.6 (55.3)(^{ab})</td>
<td>16.7 (23.9)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{4}) - Novaluron 10EC</td>
<td>1.0 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Insect Growth Regulator</td>
<td>70.9 (57.4)(^{ab})</td>
<td>6.7 (12.4)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{5}) - Indoxacarb 15.8EC</td>
<td>1.0 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Oxadiazine</td>
<td>73.5 (59.0)(^{ab})</td>
<td>16.7 (23.9)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{6}) - \textit{Bacillus thuringiensis} var. \textit{kurstaki} (Delfin)</td>
<td>1.0 g l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Biological insecticide</td>
<td>90.1 (71.7)(^{a})</td>
<td>0.0 (0.5)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{7}) - \textit{Bacillus thuringiensis} var. \textit{kurstaki} (DOR Bt-1)</td>
<td>1.0 g l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Biological insecticide</td>
<td>88.5 (70.3)(^{a})</td>
<td>0.0 (0.5)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{8}) - Dimethoate 50EC</td>
<td>1.7 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Organophosphate</td>
<td>60.7 (51.2)(^{ab})</td>
<td>20.0 (26.1)(^{ab})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{9}) - Malathion 50EC</td>
<td>1.0 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Organophosphate</td>
<td>33.6 (35.4)(^{ab})</td>
<td>36.7 (37.2)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{10}) - Monocrotophos 36SL</td>
<td>1.4 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Organophosphate</td>
<td>56.4 (48.7)(^{ab})</td>
<td>33.3 (35.2)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{11}) - Profenofos 50EC</td>
<td>1.0 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Organophosphate</td>
<td>52.2 (46.2)(^{ab})</td>
<td>26.7 (31.0)(^{ab})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{12}) - Lambda-cyhalothrin 5EC</td>
<td>1.0 ml l(^{-1})</td>
<td>Synthetic pyrethroid</td>
<td>31.9 (34.4)(^{ab})</td>
<td>53.3 (46.9)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(T_{13}) - Untreated check</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>98.2 (82.4)(^{a})</td>
<td>0.0 (0.5)(^{a})</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CD (p=0.05)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>4.30</td>
<td>9.53</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figures in parentheses are arcsine transformed values; In a column means followed by a common letter are not significantly different at p = 0.05 by LSD; HAT - hours after treatment.
mortality), while monocrotophos, malathion and lambda-cyhalothrin were rated as slightly harmful (30-79% mortality) to pupa of *S. maculipennis*.

The adult mortality of *S. maculipennis* varied from 0.0 to 100% among the treatments at 48 HAT (Table 2). No adult mortality occurred in Btk formulations (Delfin and DOR Bt-1) and untreated control. It was followed by lower per cent adult mortality of *S. maculipennis* was observed with novaluron (0.0 and 13.3% mortality at 24 and 48 HAT, respectively), flubendiamide (13.3 and 23.3% at 24 and 48 HAT, respectively) and chlorantraniliprole (20.0 and 26.7% at 24 and 48 HAT, respectively). Emamectin benzoate, indoxacarb and dimethoate recorded a mortality of 43.3, 66.7 and 90.0% at 48 HAT, respectively. Malathion, profenofos, monocrotophos and lambda-cyhalothrin caused 100% adult mortality at 48 HAT (Table 2.). Grading of toxicity of insecticides to natural enemies recommended by IOBC revealed that Btk formulations, novaluron, flubendiamide and chlorantraniliprole were rated as harmless (<30% mortality). Emamectin benzoate and indoxacarb were rated as slightly harmful (30-79% mortality) while dimethoate was classified as moderately harmful with 80-99% mortality. Profenofos, monocrotophos, malathion and lambda-cyhalothrin, which caused 100% mortality to adults at 48 HAT, were rated as harmful.

Natural enemies are important in suppressing insect pest populations. Conversely, the use of insecticides because of its magnificent and quick results in suppressing the pests in almost all situations has temporarily ignored the long lasting benefit of bio-control agents and enhanced the sole reliance on chemical control. This has resulted in deleterious effects such as insecticide resistance, pest resurgence and secondary pest outbreaks due to elimination of natural enemies (Roy et al., 2017). IPM programmes would be more successful if the insecticides were effective only against the insect pests and relatively safer to natural enemies. A step-wise assessment, moving from laboratory to field is recommended in the screening of insecticides against bio-control agents (Croft, 1990). In the present investigation, toxicity of newer, biological and conventional insecticides was studied against egg parasitoid, *Trichogramma chilonis* (Snellenius, 1984) and larval parasitoid, *Snellenius maculipennis*, and it was found that Btk preparations, novaluron, flubendiamide and chlorantraniliprole were harmless to the principal parasitoids of castor semilooper. Srinivasan and Babu (2000) evaluated the toxicity of various B. thuringiensis products (Delfin, Biobit, Spichthin and Halt) against three species of egg parasitoids viz., *T. chilonis, T. japonicum* and *T. brasiliensis* and found that all the Bt preparations were safe for the growth and development of parasitoids. Firake et al. (2017) reported that *B. thuringiensis* var. *kurstaki* were found harmless to three important
parasitoids of cabbage butterflies viz., *Hyposoter ebeninus*, *Cotesia glomerata* and *Plutomalus pumparum*. The results are in accordance with the present findings. Gashawbeza (2011) found that novaluron was safer to parasitoid of diamondback moth, *Diadegma* sp. as compared to lambda-cyhalothrin and profenofos which is in line with the present findings. Our findings are also consistent to those of Rodrigo et al. (2017) who reported that flubendiamide and chlorantraniliprole were harmless to the parasitoids, *T. chilonis* and *Copidosoma truncatellum*.

Among insecticide classes, increasing toxicity of organophosphates and synthetic pyrethroids to natural enemies have been reported in the literature (Theiling and Croft, 1988; Easwaramoorthy et al., 1994; Rao et al., 2002; Bueno et al., 2008; Uma et al., 2014). In general, the organophosphate and synthetic pyrethroid insecticides are the cheapest and widely available conventional insecticides to the castor growers, thus they are frequently over used. Nevertheless, previous studies as well as our results showed that these conventional insecticides were not safe for natural enemies (Wang et al., 2008; Carmo et al., 2010; Uma et al., 2014). The use of chemical or biological insecticides with high selectivity characters and reducing the frequency of application of hazardous insecticides are simple methods for conserving natural enemies. Hence, the data presented here will be useful in developing IPM module to unify the sustainable and safe use of chemical and bio-control methods.

**Acknowledgments**

The authors are highly thankful to the Director, ICAR-Indian Institute of Oilseeds Research, Hyderabad, India for providing necessary facilities during the course of experimentation. We are also thankful to Dr. P. Jeyakumar, Director (PHM), NIPHM, Hyderabad for providing *Trichogramma chilonis*.

**References**


